

***Monastic and Sacerdotal Models of the Church in the West
from Gregory VII (1073-1085) to Innocent III (1198)***
Yves Congar, O. P.

Translated by W. L. North from the reprint in Yves Congar, *Etudes d'ecclésiologie médiévale*, Collected Studies Series 168, London: Variorum 1983.

Historians like to avoid universal claims, generalizations, and simplifications.

Nonetheless, it seems fair to say that the tenth and the eleventh centuries were permeated by a monastic ideal. Monks appeared as the supports of Christian society not only because of their structured society, but also because they determined and set the hierarchy of officially accepted values.¹ Influential men and counselors of princes arose out of the monastic life. Cluny acquired a power which can be shown to have rivaled that of kings, if not that of the pope himself. Until the mid-twelfth century, an entire current of thought considered the monastic state as the highest and most secure on the ladder of Christian callings.² This perfection was valued according to ascetic criteria, namely the greatest abstention from earthly pleasures and the greatest austerity.³

¹ For an evocation of the whole: H. Wolter, *Ordericus Vitalis. Ein Beitrag zur kluniazensischen Geschichtsschreibung*, (Wiesbaden, 1955), pp.2-5. The *Apologeticus* of Abbo of Fleury (d.1004) is characteristic in this respect: PL 139, 463B. In the historiography of the period, one frequently locates between the Apostles, the martyrs, and the Fathers on the one hand, and the Antichrist on the other, the continent and the monks: the latter characterize the time of peace in the Church. Along this line of interpretation, Fr. Heer, *Die Tragödie des Heiligen Reiches*, (Zürich, 1952), p.198, cites Honorius Augustodunensis, Anselm of Havelberg, Hugh of St. Victor (cf. W. Schneider, *Geschichte und Geschichtsphilosophie bei Hugo von St. Viktor*. (Münster, 1933), p.133); Otto of Freising (*Chronica*, edited by A. Hofmeister, pp.370ff; and John of Salisbury. One should add Adam Scot (fl.1179-80) *De tripartito tabernaculo*, II, 19, no.136, in PL 198, col.739; Sermo 8: De Triplici Ecclesiae statu IX-XI, cols.145-46.

² It is thus that, in commenting of Apocalypse 21:11ff, Rupert of Deutz (d.1129), a member of the conservative line of thought, writes: "nomine muri firmiores, magisque spiritualis propositi fideles; civitatis autem appellatione plateas civitatis, id est laxioris vitae maximeque laicalis ordinis multitudinem significat" (*In Apocalypsim*, Bk.XII, PL 169, col.1201 A). Compare also *De Trinitate et operibus eius. In Regibus*, III, 10 (PL 167, col.1150-51), within the framework of the three classic ordines; Honorius Augustodunensis, *Elucidarium* III, 2 (PL 172, col.457CD); Gilbert of Limerick (d.1140) *De statu Ecclesiae* (PL 159, col.997A); Otto of Freising, *Chronica* VII, 9, between 1143 and 1146.

³ Abbo of Fleury, *Apologeticus*, PL 139, col.463; for Cluny, cf. P. Lamma, *Momenti di storiografia cluniacense* (= Studi storici, 42-44), (Rome, 1961); Rupert of Deutz, *Ad Lizelinum*: "Sic nimirum in sancta Ecclesia quanto

It is true that monasticism became heavily clericalized. After the middle of the 7th century, the percentage of monk-priests increased, yet the growth was neither homogeneous nor usually continuous.⁴ In an approximate and general way, one can state that at the end of the 8th century, priests and deacons represented 20% of the monastic population; they reached 60% in the 9th century, 25% of whom were priests; 75% in the 10th century, 40-50% of whom were priests. In the 12th century, despite some debate and discussion,⁵ and despite disagreement over the monks' pastoral exercise of their priesthood that will long continue, the monks openly claimed equality, or even more: the identity of their priesthood with that of parish priests, for example Rupert of Deutz, Honorius Augustodunensis, and finally Gratian, who was himself a monk.⁶ Monks are clerics, says Hugh of Rouen.⁷ But where did this itch come from for all to want to be clerics and to have oneself ordained a priest, asks Bernard? On both sides, Rupert of Deutz on the one, and Phillip of Harvengt, spokesman for the regular canons, on the other,

quisque ordo est arctior, tanto est altior" (PL 170, col.663C); Otto of Freising, Chronica VII, 35; Rufinus (1157-9), Summa Decretorum, C.XIV, q.1, edited by H. Singer, (Paderborn, 1902), pp.339-40. We are not going to enter here into the debate which has arisen in the last few years on the subject of "contemptus mundi.

⁴ Cf. J. Winandy, "Les moines et le sacerdoce," Vie spirituelle 336 (1949): 23-26; Hofmeister, "Mönchtum und Seelsorge bis zum 13. Jahrhundert," Studien und Mitteilungen zur Geschichte des Benediktiner Ordens 65 (1953/54):209-73, esp.245ff; O. Nussbaum, Kloster, Priestermonch und Privatmesse. Ihr Verhältnis im Westen von den Anfängen bis zum hohen Mittelalter (=Theophaneia, 14), (Bonn, 1961), esp. pp.78-81; J.Leclercq, "Le sacerdoce des moines," Irenikon 36 (1963):5-40, and "On the Monastic Priesthood according to the Ancient Medieval Tradition," Studia Monastica 3:1 (1961):137-55.

⁵ An example of this (ca.1132-33) is found in the very interesting dossier assembled by R. Foreville and J. Leclercq, "Un débats sur le sacerdoce des moines au XIIe siècle," Studia Anselmiana 41 (1957): 8-118.

⁶ Cf. L. Hödl, Die Geschichte der scholastischen Literatur und der Theologie der Schlüsselgewalt I (= Beiträge zur Geschichte der Philosophie und Theologie des Mittelalters, 38), (Münster, 1960), pp.166-72. Gratian, Decretum, Dictum post c.16 and post c.40 C.XVI q.1 (ed. Friedberg, 767ff, 737); and Ch. Dereine, "Le problème de la «cura animarum» chez Gratian," Studia Gratiana II (1954): 305-318.

⁷ Dialogue, VI, 4 (PL 192, col.1219).

criticize the state of affairs which has thus been created.⁸

Although this change takes place within a universal context, it occurs most particularly within an ecclesiological context, a few key aspects of which I must now evoke.

The current of monasticism has been animated by the desire for heaven and by an expectation of what the end time would be like. Thus, the periods which have been heavily eschatological have been the periods of great monastic vitality. This was the case in the last third of the 11th century and the first half of the 12th with its intense search for a monastic life far from groups (eremiticism) and the extraordinary expansion of Cistercian monasticism. But within Christendom, other values were also being affirmed, which were certainly connected to broader historical conditions and movements (demography and rising standard of living, greater population movement, crusades, etc.) but were also related to the needs and internal evolution of the Church.

It has been shown that Gregory VII prized the characteristics of militancy and service of one's neighbor, if these derived from true love and in accordance with the will of God. He canonized Erlembald, leader of the Milanese Pataria who was assassinated in 1075, and called him strenuissimus miles Christi (Reg.I,27), although the term militia Christi traditionally meant the monastic life.⁹ He developed an ideal of true love by virtue of which aiding one's neighbor

⁸ Rupert of Deutz, In Regulam Sancti Benedicti III, 12 (PL 170, col.520): "Ut quid tot sacerdotes in coenobiis?"; Phillip of Harvengt, De institutione clericorum, IV: De continentia clericorum, c.LXXXIV (PL 203, col.778): it is not necessary to be a priest to be abbot (two curious cases of women who become monks and, one of them, abbot!) but "in tantum haec licentia nostris excrevisse temporibus invenitur, ut iam in monasteriis, non solum abbatem, verum etiam aliquem monachum vix contingat haberi qui non se videat ad ordines promoveri."

⁹ Cf. C. Erdmann, Die Entstehung des Kreuzzugsgedankens, (Stuttgart, 1935), pp.128-9; 197. On the changing application of the term militia Christi, see H. Beumann, "Kreuzzugsgedanke und Ostpolitik im Mittelalter," Historisches Jahrbuch 72 (1952): 115, and Erdmann, Die Entstehung..., pp.186ff.

and coming to the aid of the oppressed came before prayers, fasts, vigils, etc.¹⁰ Gregory stigmatized as desertion Count Hugh of Burgundy's entry into the monastery;¹¹ he approved the marriage of Countess Mathilda.¹² Of course, one cannot accuse him of being anti-monastic, since he kept his monastic habit all his life and observed the rigor of the fasts enjoined by the rule. But he drew out to its fullest implications the principle that charity non quaerit quae sua sunt and reminded the monks of this when he pressed them to take a more active role in the militant life of the church.¹³ Gregory VII, a monk himself, favored the institution of regular canons: clerics and priests practicing a semi-monastic life in the service of the faithful.¹⁴

On condition that we preserve Gregory's character as an ascetic, a man of faith, and a man of prayer, it is fair, however, to situate him in a movement which one can discern in the 11th and beginning of the 12th century, which distanced itself from the extremes of asceticism, instead giving primacy to moral attitudes concerning external actions and presenting a taste for efficacious charity.¹⁵ Thus, as G. Tellenbach has well noted, a hierarchy of the

¹⁰ See Registrum I, 50, of 4 March 1074 (ed. E. Caspar, 76-7). See A. Nitschke, "Die Wirksamkeit Gottes in der Welt Gregors VII. Eine Untersuchung über die religiösen Aeusserungen und politischen Handlungen des Papstes," Studi Gregoriani 5 (1956): 117-219, esp. 137 and 140.

¹¹ Registrum VI, 17, 2 January 1079 (ed. Caspar, p.423), to the abbot of Cluny: «non perpendis, non consideras, in quanto periculo, in quanta miseria sancta versatur ecclesia... Ecce qui Deum videnter timere vel amare, de bello Christi fugiunt, salutem fratrum postponunt et in seipsos tantum amantes quietem requirunt."

¹² Cf. the account of Bernold of Constance, with an apologetic tone: Chronicon, in MGH SS V, p.449.

¹³ Registrum VI, 17, ed. Caspar, p.424 n.11; see also the letter to Hugh of Cluny of 20 March 1074, Registrum I, 62 (ed. Caspar, 90).

¹⁴ G. Bardy, "Grégoire VII et la réforme canoniale au XIe siècle," Studi Gregoriani I (1947): 47-64; J. Leclercq, "Un témoignage sur l'influence de Grégoire VII dans la réforme canoniale," Studi Gregoriani 6 (1959/61): 173-227.

¹⁵ On this B. Schmeidler, "Anti-asketische Aeusserungen aus Deutschland im 11. und beginnenden 12. Jahrhundert," Kultur- und Universalgeschichte. W. Goetz zum 60. Geburtstag dargebracht, (Leipzig, 1927): 35-52. He particularly cites Wipo, although he notes this text of 1072. When Siegfried, archbishop of Mainz, wished to

clerical/sacerdotal type tended to be juxtaposed or perhaps even to replace the monastic-ascetic hierarchy.¹⁶ It has also been noted that Gregory attributes the title spirituales homines not only to monks, in contrast to laymen and secular clerics, but to the entire people of the Church, monks and clerics, in contrast to laymen.¹⁷

A parallel semantic evolution soon marked the use of the expression vita apostolica. Restricted until then to monasticism with its poverty and its vita communis, the term was claimed by the canons regular, clerics, and priests vowed to the apostolate and pastoral care.¹⁸ Saint Norbert's Praemonstratensians are clearly not the only ones to represent regular clerics, but it is they who wrote the most to assert, in the face of monasticism, the superiority of their state and the new sense of the vita apostolica. To maintain their status, the monks accentuated the features which drew them closer to the clerics: the presbyterate and pastoral care.¹⁹ In addition,

resign and retire to Cluny, the clergy and people wrote to him: "Fatemur pater, eos bene facere, qui saeculum relinquunt. quique se ipsos abnegantes et crucem suam baiulantes, post Christum vadunt. Sed hoc utique eorum est, qui sibi solis vivunt; quia in vinea Domini Sabaoth nullam colendi curam acceperunt; quibus satis est, ut, si tantum possint se salvare quidem nullo habent de se rationem reddere. Tu autem pater, melius regis saeculum quam relinquis...(citation of Jn.21:17)... Omnis ordo, omnis dignitas, omnis professio apostolicae subditur dignitati. Nec quicquam est in muno eminentius vel vicinius Deo vita episcopali, cui cedit ut minor omnis monachus vel reclusus, omnis cenobita vel heremita"(cited, op. cit. pp.48-9).

¹⁶ G. Tellenbach. Libertas. Kirche und Weltordnung im Zeitalter des Investiturstreits (=Forschungen zur Kirchen- und Geistesgeschichte, 7), (Stuttgart, 1956), pp.67ff.

¹⁷ L. Chr. Achelis, "Studien über das "geistliche Amt", " Theologische Studien und Kritiken 62:1 (1889): 7-79, esp.17-19.

¹⁸ Cf. M.-D. Chenu, "Moines, clercs et laïcs au carrefour de la vie évangélique (XIIe siècle)," RHE 49 (1954) 59-89; reprinted in La Théologie du douzième siècle (=Études de philosophie médiévale, 45), (Paris, 1957), pp.225-51. See also the remarkable studies of C. Dereine, synthesized in his article "Chanoines réguliers," in Dictionnaire d'histoire et géographie ecclésiastique 12, cols.353-405; H. de Lubac, Exégèse médiévale. Les quatre sens de l'Écriture I/2 (=Théologie, 41), (Paris, 1959), p.579; H.M. Vicaire, L'Imitation des Apôtres. Moines, chanoines et mendiants Ve-XIIIe siècles, (Paris, 1963); La Réforme des prêtres au moyen âge. Texts choisis et présentés par F. Petit, (Paris, 1968).

¹⁹ Cf. Rupert of Deutz, Altercatio monachi et clerici, quod liceat monacho praedicare, PL 170, cols.537-42; Epistola ad Everardum, cols. 541-44; the De vita vera apostolica, cols.609-64, although its attribution to Rupert is questionable; and the Epistola ad Lizelinum, cols.663-68.

Urban II, recognizing the duality of the forms of God's service, canonized both of forms of religious life as "unius pene eiusdem propositi portiones."²⁰

All these inflections announce the moment when, in place of seeing the Church as the eschatological reality which is in exilio or peregrinans, one will talk about the Ecclesia militans, a supernatural society preparing the way for the Ecclesia triumphans — this renewal of language starting around 1160.²¹ The desire for heaven will continue powerfully to animate souls. But in this society in transition, the Church will come to be active, first and foremost: a Church of clerics, a Church of schools and, soon, of universities. In the predominantly monastic world of antiquity, the Church, when most truly itself, resided in the monks: St. Bernard and Otto of Freising make this clearly understood.²² In contrast, Praemonstratensian apologists for the canons regular exalt the priesthood in the Church. Anselm of Havelberg (d.1158) thinks that the monks belong to the sparkling beauty of the Church, but that the Church could survive without them, through the ministry of the priests and above all, through the ministry of the Word.²³

²⁰ Cf. Urban's bull for the church of Raitenbach, 1092, which became a model text for the papal chancery and is found reproduced in other contexts (such as in the confirmation of the order of Prémontré in 1124, PL 198, col.36); PL 151, col.338-9. Cf. C. Dereine, "L'Elaboration du statut canonique des Chanoines réguliers, spécialement sous Urbain II," RHE 46 (1951): 534-65.

²¹ See our L'Eglise de saint Augustine à l'époque moderne (=Histoire des dogmes, III/3), (Paris, 1970), pp.164-65.

²² In this way, St. Bernard, who has a very spiritual and personal idea of the Church, although he does not reduce it to monks alone. On the ecclesial excellence of monks who nourish the entire body of the Church, cf. Apologia 10, 24 (PL 182, col.912); Sermo 93 de divitiis (PL 183, cols.715ff); Sermo 46 in Cantica Cantorum (PL 183, cols.1004ff); cf. Y. Congar, "L'Ecclésiologie de saint Bernard," in Saint Bernard Théologien (= Analecta sacri Ordinis Cistercensis, 9:3-4(1953)), pp.136-90. For Otto of Freising, only the holiness of the monks makes God support a wicked world: Chronica VII, 34 (ed. Hofmeister, p.369).

²³ To Abbot Egbert of Huysberg: "Tolle interim omne genus monachorum et in Ecclesia Dei secundum ordinationem Christi iuxta Apostolum habeamus alios quidem prophetas, alios apostolos, alios vero evangelistas, alios autem pastores et doctores, et alios clericorum ordines: nonne isti sufficiunt ad consummationem corporis Christi, quae est Ecclesia? Quae tamen, etsi absque monachis bene et ordinate consistere posset, decentius tamen et

Phillip of Harvengt's (d.1182) De institutione clericorum is full of praise for the priesthood:

"Magna et praecipua dignitas clericorum, quae nimirum sic inter Deum et populum media collocatur ut Deo subdita populo praeferatur..."²⁴ At the end of the 12th century, Adam Scott sees in the priesthood the sun which brightens the sky which is the Church.²⁵

This exaltation of the priesthood is contemporary with and, in all likelihood, deeply interconnected with the development of the schools. The second treatise of Phillip of Harvengt's De institutione clericorum is entitled "De scientia clericorum". There, in addressing himself to his friend Herwald, Phillip already praises Paris as the capital of sacred science: "Felix civitas in qua sancti codices tanto studio revolvuntur..."²⁶ Of course, the monks had their cloister schools for the formation of young oblates, they cultivated Sacred Scripture and the Fathers, thus producing the substantial and flavorful fruits of what dom Jean Leclercq has called "monastic theology." The schools which grew up in the towns in the 12th century are something different.²⁷ Indeed, so different are they that a witness to the spirituality of the cloister, which was still vibrant among the regular canons, could towards the end of the 12th century set up an opposition and speak of those "who are made drunk with scholastic rather than theological

pulchrius tanquam varietate circumamicta diversis electorum ordinibus exstruitur et decoratur" (PL 188, col1136 BC). Date: 1149-50.

²⁴ De institutione clericorum, IV: "De continentia clericorum", c.69, in PL 203, col.258 B.

²⁵ Sermon for the feast of St. Stephen: PL 198, col.275. This is, however, the classic comparison of the sacerdotium with the sun, and the regnum with the moon.

²⁶ Epistola 3, in PL 203, col.31 D.

²⁷ See Ph. Delhaye, "L'Organisation scolaire au XIIe siècle," Traditio 5 (1947): 211-68; M.-D. Chenu, La Théologie au XIIe siècle, (Paris, 1957), pp.343-50.

wine."²⁸ But the monks' failure to adapt to the teaching of the schools and to its dialectical method will play its role in the replacement of the monks by clerics.²⁹ The appreciation of these values was already changing. Thus, when writing his Summa between 1204 and 1207, Robert Curzon could write: "Qui legit publice sacram scripturam, iter maioris perfectionis arripuit quam aliquis Clarevallensis."³⁰

All of these changes could not have been achieved without some changes in the most cultivated authorities and masters. In the 12th century schools, Aristotle will slowly gain in influence. From the religious point of view proper, the fathers of monastic theology, Gregory and Isidore, give way to Augustine, father of the regular clergy.³¹ Furthermore, it is not only in the order of religious models that Augustine experiences this advance: J.R. Gieselmann has shown how he also supplanted Isidore in sacramental theology of the eucharist.³²

The locus of this conflict of influence is significant. Fundamentally, monasticism

²⁸ De gloria et honore filii hominis Epistola, PL 194, col.1074 A, cited by J. Leclercq in "Les études dans les monasteres du Xe au XIIe siècle," in Los monjes y los estudios, (Abbaye de Poblet, 1963), pp.105-117 at 115.

²⁹ Comment of Delhaye in his review of Chenu's La Théologie au XIIe siècle in RHE 54 (1959): 541.

³⁰ Cited by Chenu in La Théologie au XIIe siècle, p.260, following C. Dickson, AHDLAMA 9 (1934): 73.

³¹ One encounters it, for example, in the patristic citations of Deusededit and in other canonical collections: cf. Ch. Munier, Les sources patristiques du droit de l'Eglise du VIIIe au XIIIe siècle, (Mulhouse, 1957), pp.37-8 and 43. This remark does not hold true, however, for the collection concerning the regular cenobitic life which J. Leclercq analysed and edited (see above, n.14, op.cit. p.178). Anselm of Havelberg, in his historical theology of the different forms of religious life, writes: "In hoc statu apparuerunt viri religiosi, amatores veritatis, instauratores religionis, Augustinus Hipponensis ecclesiae episcopus, provinciae Numidiae legatus, qui collectis non falsis fratribus vita apostolica praelegit vivere," Dialogi I, 10 (PL 188, col.1154D).

³² J.R. Gieselmann, Die Eucharistielehre der Vorscholastik, (Paderborn, 1926), pp.263ff, 370ff; Die Abendmahlslehre an der Wende der Spätantike zum Frühmittelalter. Isidor von Sevilla und das Sakrament der Eucharistie, (Munich, 1933), pp.235-36.

develops the baptismal life of the believer.³³ The Eucharist, on the other hand, makes the Church into the Body of Christ — but it is a priestly sacrament. Already the development of the Eucharist in the thought and devotion of precisely the period delimited by our study is remarkable and new. Berengar of Tours' error along with Cardinal Humbert's and Gregory VII's intervention unleashed the movement (which has been so well elucidated by P. Henri de Lubac) that led to the characterization of the eucharistic bread as the corpus verum and the Church as the corpus mysticum.³⁴ Prémontré was marked by a great devotion to the Eucharist. And since Innocent III figures in the title of our study as one of the limits of our research, how can one not evoke his De sacro altaris mysterio or, more precisely, De missarum mysteriis, which was begun and perhaps even completed before his election to the see of Rome.

Some time ago I had noted the minimal place which the Eucharist seems to occupy in the works of St. Bernard.³⁵ It was then that the late Etienne Delaruelle wrote to me:

"so, Bernard is still of the early Middle Ages, an age which seems to me, if I may say so, pre-eucharistic and likewise pre-sacerdotal. It seems to me that the XIII-XV centuries were an essentially "clerical" age, not in the sense of the political problems which are linked to clericalism, but in the sense that at that time Catholicism was essentially a sacramental religion. Previously, it was the time of the monks for whom the Eucharist is not essential. I believe that one of the great facts of the XI-XII centuries is the rehabilitation of the priesthood by the Gregorian Reform (the chapters) which made possible this "sacerdotalism".(Letter 19-3-1954)

³³ This idea will be subjected to the criticism of the 13th-century Parisian secular masters against the mendicants: the religious, they will say, are perficiendi, a category which encompasses monachi, fideles laici et catechumeni: thus William of Saint-Amour, Tractatus brevis de periculis novissimorum temporum, c.2; M. Bierbaum, Bettelorden und Weltgeistlichkeit an der Universität Paris (Münster, 1920), pp.12ff; the bishops and curates were the perfectores, with invocation of texts from Pseudo-Dionysius.

³⁴ de Lubac, Corpus Mysticum. L'Eucharistie et l'Eglise au moyen age, (Paris, 1944); 2nd edition (= Théologie, 3), (Paris, 1949).

³⁵ Cf. the study cited above (n.22), p.148.

In fact, during our period the role of the priest was exalted — the priest whose gestures and whose words, which reproduced those of Christ, efficaciously achieved the transformation [of the bread and wine] during the consecration.³⁶ In the context and the climate of the struggle against clerical incontinence, one loved to compare the condition of the priest with that of the Virgin Mary.³⁷ A text of an unknown author, which dates from the 12th century and has been rather frequently cited, said: "O veneranda sacerdotum dignitas, in quorum manibus Dei Filius velut in utero Virginis incarnatur ..." ³⁸ Saint Norbert of Xanten (d.1134) composed a poem De sacerdotio, and maxims of astonishing fervor are attributed to him:

Sacerdos, Tu non es tu, quia Deus es
 Tu non es tui, quia servus et minister Christi es

 Tu non es de te, quia nihil es.
 Quis ergo es tu, o Sacerdos? Nihil et omnia...³⁹

All this depends upon an internal development, i.e. a movement which animates the life

³⁶ Such is the position of the Summa Sententiarum of Peter Lombard; Cf. J. Brinktrine, "Zur Lehre der mittelalterlichen Theologie über die Konsekrationsform der Eucharistie. I: Von Paschasius Radbertus bis zu Hugo von Saint-Cher (d.1264). II. Von dem Verfasser der «Summa Sententiarum» (Hugo von St. Viktor?) bis zu St. Thomas von Aquin," Theologie und Glaube 45 (1955): 188-207, 260-275. Phillip of Harvengt writes: "Presbyter cuius est sacro manus uncta liquore, in altari corpus Christi conficit sacro ore, cum substantiam panis et vini veraciter corruptibilem nullo penitus dubitante, signo crucis et virtute verborum adhibitis, reddit incorruptam, ascriptam, ratam, Spiritu efficaciter operante": De institutione clericorum IV: De continentia clericorum, c.CVII (PL 203, 812C).

³⁷ Thus, St. Peter Damian, Opusculum 17, c.3 and Opusculum 18 d.1, c.1 (PL 145, 384D and 388B), cited in R. Laurentin, Marie, l'Eglise et le Sacerdoce (titre de la couverture). I. Essai sur le développement d'une idee religieuse, (Paris, 1952), pp.115-16. Compare Peter Comestor, Sermon pour un synode diocésain, published by J.-P. Bonnes, "Un des plus grands predicateurs du XIIe siècle. Geoffrey Babion," RB 56 (1945/46): 174-215; cf. p.213 for the great exaltation of the eucharistic power of the priest.

³⁸ Cf. Laurentin, *ibid.*, p.43 with n.41.

³⁹ Cited by M. Fitzthum, Die Christologie der Prämonstratenser im 12. Jahrhundert (Diss. 1939), p.23. On the eucharistic devotion of the Premonstratensians, cf. F. Petit, La spiritualité des Prémontrés aux XIIe et XIIIe siècles (= Études de théologie et d'histoire de la spiritualité, 10), (Paris, 1947), pp.225-33.

of the Church itself, but which is at the same time inseparable from the evolution of society in general. Yet one must also give due weight, in the exaltation of the priesthood of ordained ministers, to the need to respond to popular anti-ecclesiastical heresies such as one sees emerging over the course of the 11th century and then filling the 12th. These heretics denied the very priesthood of ministers and attacked or imitated the Eucharist.⁴⁰ In contrast, they demanded a poor and "apostolic" life. The defenders of the catholic faith or the councils devoted themselves from then on to defending, justifying, and developing the priesthood and the Eucharist.⁴¹ The one and the other rose or fell together. For one increasingly defined the priesthood by its power to consecrate the Eucharist,⁴² whereas previously it had been characterized by the power of the keys, a feature which is still found occasionally until the beginning of the 13th century.⁴³ In any case, whether under provocation of circumstances or the pressure of the masters' intense efforts in the schools, the 12th century worked with great intensity on the theology of the sacraments.

Through all of this, and in still other respects (development of law, relations between the

⁴⁰ Discussed with bibliography in our work (cited above n.21), p.198-209. A more complete bibliography prepared by Herbert Grundmann and reproduced in Hérésies et sociétés dans l'Europe pré-industrielle. XIe - XVIIIe siècles, presented by J. LeGoff, (Paris/La Haye, 1968), pp.407-87. Likewise, see, of course, Grundmann's classic work Religiöse Bewegungen im Mittelalter, (Berlin, 1935; expanded edition, Hildesheim, 1961).

⁴¹ See the council of Lombers 1176 (Mansi, t.22, 162ff); Peter the Venerable, Contra Petrobrusianos of 1134? (PL 189, cols.787-8, 808); Hugh of Rouen, Contra haereticos, II, from 1145-47, (PL 192, cols.1273ff); Eckhart of Schönau, Sermones adversus Catharos, 1163, "Sermo 10" (PL 195, cols.69ff). Clearly see also the professions of faith imposed on the Waldensians and already, in 1179, on Valdes himself (text edited by A. Dondaine in Archivum fratrum predicatorum 16 (1946): pp.231ff).

⁴² Thus Hugh of Rouen, Contra haereticos, II, §2 and §10 (PL 192, col.1276 and 1281D), and cf. our work cited above (n.21), p.170 and 173.

⁴³ Thus Phillip of Harvengt, see above (n.24). Further, see Bernard de Fontcaude, Contra Vallenses, a little after 1185, c.2 (PL 204, col.798ff); Radulphus Ardens, Speculum universale, between 1190 and 1200; the IV Lateran Council, c.Firmiter, in which the Eucharist is proposed, before baptism, as the most characteristic act of the Church (Denziger, n.430; Denzinger-Schönmetzer, n.802). For this conception of the Church, see our L'Ecclésiologie du haut-moyen âge. (Paris, 1968), pp.141-48.

two powers, etc.) the age opened by the so-called Gregorian reform appears increasingly as the age of a decisive turning point in the secular history of Western Christendom.